

REMARKS / ARGUMENTS

Applicant submits that the cancellation of claims 10-13 renders moot all rejections of those claims.

New claim 14 is supported by original claim 10 and the specification.

Claims 1-13 were rejected under 35 USC 103(a) over Altmann et al and Trimble et al. Applicants request reconsideration and withdrawal of this rejection for the reasons that follow.

Applicants acknowledge that epothilones and their utility for treating proliferative diseases was known in the art and that Altmann et al discloses compounds within the scope of present formula I.

Trimble et al discloses agents potentially suitable for the treatment of platinum resistant ovarian cancer and includes treatment with several antimetabolites. The reference also indicates that an epothilone analog is under investigation for the treatment of platinum resistant ovarian cancer. Although Trimble et al discloses antimetabolites and indicates that an epothilone derivative is under investigation, the reference fails to provide any motivation for the artisan to combine utilize an antimetabolite and an epothilone together for treating the condition. Therefore, the combined disclosure of the references does not suggest the present invention.

Entry of this amendment and reconsideration and allowance of the claims is requested.

Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp.
Patents Pharma
One Health Plaza, Building 104
East Hanover, NJ 07936-1080
(862) 778-7824

Respectfully submitted,



George R. Dohmann
Attorney for Applicants
Reg. No. 33,593

Date: July 22, 2008